Religion and community in Dagestan: 
political ethnography of multiple belonging 
in the Muslim-majority republic of Russia

Thesis presented by Anna GLYANTS

with a view to obtaining the PhD degree in political and social sciences
(“Docteure en Sciences politiques et sociales”)

Academic year 2022-2023

Supervisor:
Aude MERLIN, Université Libre de Bruxelles

Jury Members:
François FORET, Université Libre de Bruxelles 
Firouzeh NAHAVANDI, Université Libre de Bruxelles 
Silvia SERRANO, Sorbonne Abou Dhabi 
Akhmet YARLYKAPOV, MGIMO University, Russian Academy of Sciences
## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................ 4

Note on transliteration and translation ........................................................................... 13

Glossary ............................................................................................................................. 15

List of abbreviations ......................................................................................................... 19

Introduction ........................................................................................................................ 21

1. Securitisation of intra-Muslim relations as the key issue of public debate and research on religion and politics in Dagestan ................................................................. 21

2. Forging a new research perspective from the fieldwork: grasping the local perspective about security dimension and Muslim mosaics ................................................................. 27

3. Epistemology of categorisation: the pitfalls of Islamic “labelling” in Dagestan ............. 34

4. Research problematic .................................................................................................... 35

Presentation of the Chapters ............................................................................................ 38

Chapter 1. Conceptual and methodological framework of the research ......................... 41

1. Studying religion in relation to community in a Muslim-majority context of Dagestan ...... 41

   1.1. Context-specific definition of religion within an evolving research framework .......... 41

   1.2. Tackling religion in relation to a collectivity .............................................................. 42

   1.3. Framing religion as a social relationship in context of Muslim pluralism .................. 43

   1.4. Acknowledging the backdrop of multi-level solidarities ............................................. 47

   1.5. Engaging with the concept of religious belonging as a relational dimension ............ 51

   1.6. Religious belonging and community ......................................................................... 54

2. Methodology .................................................................................................................... 56

   2.1. Sequential research process and theoretical sampling ................................................. 56

   2.2. Identification of relevant collectivities ........................................................................ 57

   2.3. Identification of contrasted social configurations of study ......................................... 58

   2.4. Everyday Islam and political ethnography approach .................................................. 64

   2.5. Collecting empirical data: an overview ...................................................................... 66

Chapter 2. Dagestani Islamic diversity in context: historical legacy, present challenges and belonging ...................................................................................................................... 85

1. Global Empires and the early development of Islam in the urban and rural Dagestan: impact and limits of external influences vs adaptations and resistance of indigenous culture .......... 85

2. The roots of diversity within the Dagestani Islam and the germs of fluidity of religious belonging .......................................................................................................................... 89

3. Historical roots of local belonging: the model of jamaat as a particular mode of collective life organisation .................................................................................................................. 92

4. Social changes and the impact of religious mobilisation on the eve and during the Russian conquest of Dagestan ..................................................................................... 97

5. Dagestani religious field and community regulation under the Russian Empire in the aftermath of the Caucasian War ......................................................................................... 107

   5.1. Top-down institutional arrangements: community actors and regulation .................. 107

   5.2. Institutional cooptation: the place of local authorities and religious elites ................ 110

6. Sovietisation of collective belonging ............................................................................. 114

   6.1. Establishment of the Soviet rule and local actors’ attempts to defend the Dagestani autonomy ......................................................................................................................... 114

   6.2. Soviet secularisation and fusionary belonging in Dagestan ....................................... 118

   6.3. Soviet institutions and Dagestani jamaats: between accommodation and transformation ... 123

   6.4. Accumulation of ethnic grievances: Soviet nationalities policies, deportation, forced resettlement and mass migration to the lowlands ..................................................... 130

Conclusion of the Chapter 2 ............................................................................................. 136
Chapter 3. Muslim diversity and Post-Soviet challenges to social cohesion: multiple grievances, multiple belonging? .......................................................... 141

1. Ethnic tensions and failed political institutions: between collective cleavages and shared grievances ................................................................. 141
   1.1. Social and political expressions of ethnic tensions in the 1990’s ......................... 141
   1.2. Crisis of state institutions: compromised system of ethnic rotation, alienation of political participation, corruption and mistrust of the rule of law .................................................. 143
2. Diversification of religious belonging against the backdrop of religiously framed violent conflicts ................................................................. 146
   2.1. Sufi presence: the muftiyat-oriented “mainstream” actors and the Sufi Sheikhs in opposition ................................................................. 148
   2.2. The broad Muslim spectrum distinct from the Sufi teaching: from reformist movements to the adepts of jihadi projects ................................................................. 150
   2.3. Development of jihadi movements in Dagestan: key structural elements and the impact on the Dagestani population ................................................................. 156
   2.4 An attempt to re-balance the religious field (2010-2012) and its aftermath in the run-up of the 2014 Sochi Olympics: the vulnerability of Salafi actors ................................................................. 161
   2.5. Transformation of the insurgency and counter-insurgency after 2013: the decline of the Caucasus Emirate and the threats of the Islamic State ................................................................. 165
3. Institutional monopolisation of the religious field by the Dagestani muftiyat .................. 168
   3.1. Emergence of the religious authority: from ethnic muftiyats to a state-muftiyat coalition 168
   3.2. Extending the muftiyat authority: top-down processes in religious education and expertise for law enforcement activities ................................................................. 174
4. Securitisation of religious belonging: pressure on the Dagestani Salafi communities and grievance-based solidarities ................................................................. 183
   4.1. Watchlists: imposed humiliation and disputed efficiency ................................................................. 183
   4.2. Raids and closure of the mosques, which were not loyal to the muftiyat ......................... 185
   4.3. From individual responsibility to collective one: counter-terrorist policy towards relatives and particular jamaats ................................................................. 187
   4.4. Abductions, forced disappearances, tortures and murders: shared grievances and attempts of solidarisation ................................................................. 191

Conclusion of the Chapter 3 .................................................................. 195

Chapter 4. How does religious belonging influence community maintenance at the local level? ................................................................. 197

1. Institutional components of religious field in contemporary Dagestan .................. 197
   1.1. Peculiarities of the Islamic religious field ................................................................. 198
   1.2. Various facets of hierarchy relationship in the religious field of Dagestan ................................................................. 199
2. Local religious authorities and collective life regulation ........................................ 209
   2.1. Defining the social source of religious authority: jamaat or the muftiyat? ................. 209
   2.2. Imam’s religious belonging as a trigger for religious solidarisation: Friday collective prayer, collective rituals and public life regulation ................................................................. 218
3. Revealing practices of religious belonging ............................................................. 228
   3.1. The number of rakats for the Friday prayer ................................................................. 228
   3.2. Mawlids ....................................................................................................................... 230
   3.3. Life cycle rites ............................................................................................................. 233

Conclusion of the Chapter 4 .................................................................. 241

Chapter 5. Religious belonging and public authorities in contemporary Dagestan: asymmetric public representations of Islam and desecularised top-down practices ......244

1. Secular authorities publicly appeal to Islam under the umbrella of patriotism ............... 244
   1.1. Secular and religious symbols in the public image of the Head of the Republic .................................................................................. 246
   1.2. The challenges of multiple belonging in public discourse of the high-level official ........ 255
1.3. Ensuring symbolic control by coercion and state-run media ............................................ 260
1.4. Narratives on Muslim pluralism ......................................................................................... 264

2. Public practices of implication of religious authorities in policy-making and socialising
activities ........................................................................................................................................ 269
2.1. Muftiyat’s engagement in informal practices aimed at promoting and sustaining public
morality ....................................................................................................................................... 270
2.2. Muslim movements and securitisation of religious belonging ........................................ 276

Conclusion of the Chapter 5 ...................................................................................................... 279

Chapter 6. Competitive orders of public regulation: legal pluralism as another factor of
interaction between secular and religious belonging ............................................................. 285
1. The analytical links between legal pluralism, religious belonging and forms of solidarities in
Dagestan ..................................................................................................................................... 285
2. ‘Lay’ activities, customary law and Muslim normative culture in Dagestan ....................... 288
2.1. Consensus about the pervasiveness of Islamic norms ....................................................... 288
2.2. The legacy of the tripartite regulation in Dagestan: customary law and Islamic provisions in
social practice ............................................................................................................................. 289
2.3. Maslahat, an exemplary informal practice rooted in various orders of public regulation ... 292

3. The areas and actors of informal normative regulation ....................................................... 295
3.1. Islamic and customary regulation within the contemporary Russian legal framework:
assessing the compatibility of different systems ....................................................................... 295
3.2. The recurrent issues treated within the Sharia system in Dagestan: practices and
representations ............................................................................................................................. 297
3.3. Enhanced status of the muftiyat as the mediator in reconciliation ................................... 300
3.4. Exclusive – yet, problematc - role of religious regulation in family matters .................... 302

4. Fragmentation of normative authority in the field of the Sharia justice in Dagestan ............ 306
5. Examples of enactment of Sharia jurisprudence: factors of applicability and success ......... 310

Conclusion of the Chapter 6 ...................................................................................................... 314

Chapter 7. Religious belonging and community-building mobilisations in Dagestan ............ 317
1. The Kumyk mobilisation around Karaman: types of belonging in an ethnically homogenous
mobilised community ................................................................................................................ 318
1.1. Relationship between religious and ethnic belonging and on the multiple pluralities of the
Kumyk case-study: theoretical considerations ......................................................................... 319
1.2. The Karaman mobilisation: articulating different levels of belonging through mobilisation for
the Karaman site .......................................................................................................................... 323
1.3. Community practices: consolidating collective memory and religious rituals around Karaman ................................................................. 332
1.4. The Alburikt community: associating religious, ethnic and locality-based belonging ........ 338
1.5. Strong legitimacy of the Kumyk religious authority as a factor of cohesion .................... 342

2. Patterns of mobilisation as revealing attributes of community shaped around the hunger
strike protest .................................................................................................................................... 344
2.1. Grasping attributed collective identities by studying mobilisation frames ......................... 344
2.2. Framing a broad social protest: no explicit reference to religious belonging ................... 347
2.3. Religious belonging in the individual narratives on human rights: prospects and limits of
inclusive discourse ...................................................................................................................... 349
2.4. Uneven accentuation of Muslim belonging in patterns of mobilisation led by collective
actors .......................................................................................................................................... 354
2.5. Un-identified solidarisation of the Salafi groups with the hunger strike: common values and
different mobilisation triggers ................................................................................................. 361

Conclusion of the Chapter 7 ...................................................................................................... 365

CONCLUSION .......................................................................................................................... 370

Appendix 1: Maps and Figures ............................................................................................... 382
Appendix 2: Posts from the Instagram account of Ramazan Abdulatipov published from 8 March 2013 to 31 December 2015 containing reference(s) to religious issues. ...............384

Appendix 3: Reconstitution of framing processes during the hunger strike in Dagestan (October-December 2014).................................................................401

Appendix 4: Counter-terrorist operation in the settlement of Vremenny (2014) ..........410

Bibliography ...........................................................................................................414

Publications in English and French .........................................................................414

Books .......................................................................................................................414

Book Chapters .........................................................................................................417

Articles .....................................................................................................................418

Dissertations ............................................................................................................427

Reports, newsletters ................................................................................................428

Publications in Russian ............................................................................................429

Books .......................................................................................................................429

Book chapters ..........................................................................................................431

Articles .....................................................................................................................431

Conference proceedings .........................................................................................437

Reports .....................................................................................................................438

Government publications .........................................................................................439

Publications in the media .........................................................................................440