

Revisiting global care chains: Power inequalities in Filipino transnational families' caregiving arrangements

Asuncion Fresnoza-Flot

Abstract: Since the 1980s, many Filipino labour migrants in the world have been women. In France, the Filipino migrant population is largely composed of migrant mothers who live in urban areas, work in the domestic service sector and have an irregular migration status. This chapter revisits the 'global care chains' debate through examination of the caregiving arrangement between Filipino migrant mothers and the women in their extended families who take care of their children in the Philippines. Ethnographic analysis reveals that such arrangements provide economic advantages but also obligations and constraints. They have important consequences on the lives of migrant women, who find themselves tied in an interdependent but unequal relationship, characterised by solidarity and enforceable trust. This case study demonstrates how childcare arrangements associated with long distance women's migration reinforce gender norms in transnational families and widen the economic gap between women sharing the same national and family identities, along the care chain. However, both the Filipino migrant mother resident in France and the stay-behind woman relative caring for her children in the Philippines generally succeed in improving their economic welfare relative to the local non-transnational families of their home area.

8.1 Introduction

The internationalisation of the domestic work sector has resulted in massive global migration, notably of women, from economically developing countries to developed economies, triggering the emergence of what Hochschild (2000, p. 131) calls 'global care chains' exemplified by 'an older daughter from a poor family who cares for her siblings while her mother works as a nanny caring for the children of a migrating nanny who, in turn, cares for the child of a family in a rich country'. Linking women of different societies through paid or unpaid care work, these asymmetrical relations among the women reflect the global social inequalities within a particular society and between developed countries of the so-called 'Global North' and those of the 'Global South'. The global care chains concept is particularly useful in the study of the service care work sector, specifically women domestic helpers (Yeates 2005; Connell and Stilwell 2006).

There is rich literature focusing on the experiences of these migrant women (e.g., Anggraeni 2006; Gamburd 2010; Hondagneu-Sotelo 2007; Lutz 2016; Parreñas 2001), but it is only recently that scholars have started paying attention to the women in female migrants' kin networks who take care of their households back home (e.g., Fresnoza-Flot and Nagasaka 2021; Pantea 2012; Mazzucato et al. 2015; Yarris 2017). In the burgeoning corpus of migration studies, it remains rare to find studies that give equal weight and attention to the viewpoints of migrant parent(s) and the women taking care of their households in their countries of origin (Dankyi et al. 2017; Ducu 2020; Poeze et al. 2016).

With the aim of contributing fresh insights, this chapter analyses women who migrated abroad as well as those who take over the caregiving of their stay-behind children referred to as "migrant mothers" and "caregivers", respectively in this chapter. Both provide care work for other people's children. By analysing the experiences of these women, this chapter seeks to unravel the power dynamics in the chain linking migrant women and their employers in the receiving country and that connecting migrant mothers and caregivers to their children back home. The following questions are posed: how do these women experience domestic care work? In what way does it affect their individual and family lives? What forms of relationships do they maintain during migration and family separation?

This chapter unpacks the experiences of Filipino migrant mothers in France and their children's caregiver(s) in the Philippines. Their relationships with one another are embedded

in 'trust networks' consisting of strong interpersonal links 'within which people set valued, consequential, long-term resources and enterprises at risk to the malfeasance, mistakes, or failures of others' (Tilly 2007, p. 7). Such a network would not be possible without the regulatory power of small local communities' 'enforceable' trust (Portes 1998). The migrant mother-caregiver relationship is likely to display what Portes and Sensenbrenner (1993, p. 1327) call 'bounded solidarity' - solidarity limited to 'members of a particular group who find themselves affected by common events in a particular time and place'.

Migrant mothers separated from their stay-behind families constitute the bulk of the estimated 50,000 Filipino immigrant population in France. They are demographically concentrated in the domestic work sector of France's large cities, notably Paris and its suburbs. In the French capital, they mainly work as housekeepers and nannies in bourgeois neighbourhoods like the 16th district. Filipinos are among the best-paid migrant domestic workers in France, when compared with pay levels in other Filipino-migrant receiving countries such as Lebanon, Spain, Italy, and the UK. The Filipino migrant women of Paris are 'employed in "up-market" domestic service, in an economic niche reserved to them', and consider themselves the 'Mercedes-Benz' of domestic workers (Mozère 2005, p. 2).

Despite their privileged position in the domestic service sector, most Filipino migrant women in France have an irregular migration status, a situation that prolongs their separation from their children back in the Philippines (Fresnoza-Flot 2009; Ito 2016). The estimated 9-million stay-behind children in the Philippines (Reyes 2008) hint at the existence of a largely uncounted number of caregivers looking after their well-being. Most of these caregivers are part of extended families in the Philippines (Aguilar 2009; Asis 2006; Parreñas 2005). Their caregiving arrangements predate the massive migration of Filipino women starting in the 1980s, which have expanded through the years (Nagasaka 1998). In 2010, for instance, 57 per cent of the registered Filipino workers abroad were women, most were married or separated from their partners (Commission on Filipinos Overseas 2011).

This chapter starts by situating the case study within the extensive literature on maternal migration and shared mothering, foregrounding the study's scholarly contribution, followed by a description of the data-gathering methods used and the women interviewed. The core of this chapter highlights the perspectives of Filipino migrant mothers and their children's caregivers separately to delineate the power inequalities they experience and the consequent effects on their lives.

8.2 Maternal migration and shared mothering

The arrangement in which the mother of the family migrates to work abroad and leaves her children under the care of someone in her country of origin has been called 'transnational motherhood' (Hondagneu-Sotelo and Avila 1997, p. 548). Studies documenting various mothering practices of migrant women and the consequences of their migration on themselves and their stay-behind family members have mounted (Fresnoza-Flot 2013; Boccagni 2012; Madianou and Miller 2011). However, the interlinkage between migrant mothers and the caregivers of the stay-behind children, awaits in-depth scholarly attention.

The caregiver in Filipino migrant women's households is usually a female member of her immediate or extended kin: notably a migrant's mother, sister, adolescent daughter, aunt, cousin, or mother-in-law (Ducu 2020; Fernández in this volume; Pantea 2012; Save the Children 2006). She assumes the caregiving obligations and domestic chores of the absent mother. In the literature, caregivers are referred to as 'other-mothers' (Schmalzbauer 2008, p. 1320), 'foster mothers' (Åkesson et al. 2012, p. 238), or 'substitute mothers' (Lan 2003, p. 194).

Shared mothering has been observed in regions where international female migration is very dynamic: in Asia (Philippines, Sri Lanka, and Indonesia), in South America (Mexico, Ecuador, Guatemala), in the Caribbean (Jamaica, Dominican Republic), and more recently, in Europe (Ukraine, Poland, and Romania) (Lutz 2002; Foamete-Ducu 2011). Shared mothering is also a common practice among migrant women living with their children in nuclear households in the destination country, since they must rely on their kin for childcare while doing careworking for the children of their employer (Moon 2003; Toro-Morn 1995).

Until the 1960s, Hispanic and Asian migrants in the United States worked in the domestic service sector for long hours 'to ensure their children's physical survival', which 'ironically denied' them 'access to their [own] children' (Collins 1994, p. 51). Shared mothering within their communities emerged to alleviate this contradiction. In some cases, migrant women living with their children in the host country, managed to get relations to follow them to the host country to look after their children, as exemplified by transnational grandmothers (Plaza 2000).

These caregivers play an essential role not only in facilitating parental migration (Cienfuegos Illanes 2010; Pérez-Caramés this volume) and assuring the wellbeing of stay-behind children but also in maintaining and mediating transnational linkages (Mazzucato and Schans 2011; Acedera and Yeoh 2021; Carling et al. 2012). Without caregivers, stay-behind children encounter more difficulties in their everyday lives, resulting in poor academic performance, emotional detachment from their parents, alcohol use, or careless spending of remittances (Dreby 2007, 2010; Lahaie et al. 2009; Piper 2009).

The system of shared mothering between sending and receiving countries can result in a feeling of indebtedness between migrant mothers and their children's caregiver. The children's caregiver back home 'often feel[s] they are offering the migrant an enormous emotional gift, regardless of material returns' (Isaksen et al. 2008, p. 69). In her study of grandmothers in Nicaragua with migrant daughters abroad, Yarris (2017) observed that these women viewed their caregiving role as sacrifice and an expression of solidarity with their daughters in their transnational households. Tensions tended to arise if the migrant mother failed to send remittances to her caregiver back home (Moran-Taylor 2008, p. 87). Many migrant mothers feel obligated to thank their childcarer through remittances and gifts. In her study of Peruvian migrant women in Chile, Cienfuegos Illanes (2010) observed, material 'repayment' has a 'symbolic component' that 'expresses the unconditional support of the mother to her family' (p. 218).

Recently, studies on shared mothering arrangements are beginning to unveil different care practices and their impact on the women and the stay-behind children. It is evident that unequal power relations among these women occur and translate into inequalities, but their forms and how they have evolved remain vague in terms of patterns of social mobility and emotional links with other actors in the 'global care chains', in addition to tensions related to how caregivers look after migrants' children and manage their remittances (Carling et al. 2012).

8.3 Fieldwork and methodology

The data presented here come from the results of ethnographic fieldwork conducted in the Ile-de-France region in France and the Tagalog-speaking region of the Philippines (including

its capital city Manila). This study was part of a larger research project on the transnational family dynamics of migrant women domestic workers in France (Fresnoza-Flot 2013). Thirty-five Filipino migrant mothers in this country and forty stay-behind family members in the Philippines were among the persons interviewed during fieldwork. The present chapter focuses on the case of twelve Filipino women: six migrant mothers in France and their six co-mothers in the Philippines.

The study adopted qualitative data-gathering methods – documentary research, semi-structured interviews and observations – and relied on snowballing to meet potential respondents. Paired interviews of migrant mothers and their children’s carers were made possible thanks to the trust of the former, who gave the researcher (Asuncion Fresnoza-Flot) the addresses and telephone numbers of their stay-behind families in the Philippines. The migrant mothers also allowed the researcher to take photos of them after each recorded interview, and the researcher showed these photos to their families during her fieldwork in the Philippines. Most of the interviews conducted in the Philippines took place in urban places, particularly in Metropolitan Manila. In many cases, the migrant mothers in France informed the carers beforehand about the researcher’s home visit, which facilitated her meeting and interviews with them.

The six migrant mothers interviewed in France worked as migrant domestic workers (housekeepers, nannies, or both). They had an average of two children resident in their country of origin, most of them being teenagers. Among the six migrant respondents, two were separated from their husbands even before their migration, two had left their spouses in the Philippines, and the other two lived in France with their husbands. Three migrant mothers were in their forties, two in their thirties, and one in her fifties. Three respondents had a college diploma, two were high school graduates, and only one had stopped school at an elementary level. Four of the respondent mothers in France had an irregular status (either undocumented or with expired tourist visas) and had been separated from their families for an average of seven years. One of the two migrant mothers, who was documented, had waited 17 years for her regularisation, a long period during which she could not visit her family in the Philippines. The other migrant had entered France as a spouse of a French national and was therefore legal from the outset of her stay.

The second group of respondents were caregivers of the stay-behind children of Filipino women interviewed in France: four were their sisters, one a mother, and one was a

mother-in-law. Among these six women, one was in her thirties, two were in their forties, one was in her fifties, and two were in their sixties. One respondent was a widow, another was single and had no children of her own, whereas the other four were married (either separated from their husband or living together with them). Only two of the caregivers interviewed had college degrees. In this chapter, the names of the respondents are replaced with pseudonyms in order to protect their privacy.

8.4 Filipino migrant mothers in France and their relationship with their employers

The decision of Filipino mothers to migrate to France is generally driven by their desire to sustain the fundamental needs of their families and to move upward in the social ladder in the Philippines through the accumulation of symbolic capital in the form of education for their children, a spacious house, car, and land titles) (Fresnoza-Flot 2013). Migration is viewed as the means to fulfil their family obligations as mothers. While these migrant women are caring for the children and house of their employers in France, another woman in their extended family back home typically looks after their children (Acedera and Yeoh 2021; Cienfuegos Illanes 2010; Yarris 2017; Fernández and Pérez-Caramés in this volume).

The migrant mothers had to maintain a friendly relationship with their employers to ensure the stability of their job. The closeness of the relationship mainly depended on their working arrangement, their type of work, and the length of their employment. Among the six migrant respondents, three were live-in domestic workers, and the others were part-timers. Domestic work that required direct care provision to persons (infants and young children, elderly, or sick people) provided opportunities for employer-employee interpersonal interactions. Despite the stress and hard work associated with such jobs, the four migrant respondents in this situation cultivated a more personal relationship with their employer. They resided in the homes of their employers or lived in a separate small apartment (*chambre de bonne*), interacted with them on a daily basis. This contrasted with the two other respondents who were housekeepers and had no regular interaction with their employers, working alone in their employers' apartments.

The length of time of their employment was also a strong determinant of the nature of the employer-employee relationship: the longer, the closer. Marieta, a 59-year-old mother of three, had worked for fourteen years as a full-time nanny and housekeeper in an affluent

French family. Before her employers transferred to another country, they were worried about Marieta's future and recommended her to friends in Paris who needed a housekeeper. The relationship of trust that Marieta had built with her former employers allowed her to quickly find a job at the end of her work contract.

Changing employers sometimes engendered emotional difficulties for migrant mothers, notably those working as nannies. For instance, Nelia left her less than one-year-old son in the Philippines to work as a full-time nanny in Paris. After twelve years, she decided to look for another job with a better salary. She described her experience of leaving:

I arrived at this family when my employer was four-months pregnant with her second child, and I left when this child, Mike, was twelve years old. It was difficult, it was very hard, for them too ... My employer told me that she already explained the situation to Mike. Mike didn't look at me, and Madam advised me to say 'good night' to his son instead of goodbye, as if I would come back the next day. I said good night to Mike. The fact that he was a boy was a coincidence. He reminded me of my son. I gave him all of my affection, yes.

Nelia's remarks suggest that a migrant mother working as a nanny may have close affective relationships with the children under her care. Alongside the sadness arising from separation from their own children, some Filipino mothers develop emotive feelings towards the children they are paid to look after. This can pose dilemmas vis-à-vis the parents that have employed them. Informal conversations with some Filipino nannies in Paris revealed how difficult it was sometimes for them to convey concern and devoted care for a child they had been with for many years without incurring the mother's suspicion and worry that their child was transferring some of their love and loyalty from the parents to the nanny. To avoid the jealousy of the biological mother, these migrant women tried to conceal their feeling of attachment towards their employer's child or children. Thus, in those situations they underwent double emotional suffering of being separated from their children in the Philippines and trying to hide their affection for the child or children they took care of in France.

8.5 The key role of caregivers in Filipino migrant mothers' households

Notwithstanding their discursive significance, transnational practices of motherhood and childcare have to meet two conditions to become a fully legitimate and viable strategy for migrant mothers. The first condition ... is economic need. The second is to have a suitable family arrangement for the children (Raijman et al. 2003, p. 743).

Backed by their economic earnings in France, the interviewed migrant mothers negotiated care for their separated children in various ways, the main strategy being 'indirect mothering' involving finding a kinswoman in the Philippines to act as their children's main caregiver, usually living in the house occupied by the children. Among the six caregivers interviewed, only one (a migrant's mother-in-law) lived in a separate house from the children. In one case, the migrant's husband, son, and caregiver lived together under one roof. Generally, the migrant mother selected a woman who had already acted as a carer for her children from time to time, before her migration.

The chosen caregivers provided hands-on care for the infants and young children of the migrants: changing their clothes, bathing them, feeding them, and putting them to sleep, bringing them to the doctor when they were sick. They assisted teenagers in looking after themselves and taught them how to perform household chores independently. In many cases, they did not impose domestic obligations on young boys and male teens; consequently, young girls and female teens shouldered the bulk of the household tasks, underscoring how surrogate caregivers reinforced gendered norms in transnational families with migrant mothers abroad. Cienfuegos Illanes (2010, p. 22) observes Peruvian migrant motherhood in Chile 'use[d] the same historic discourse' of female sacrifice 'without ever truly questioning or breaking with the principles' of the discourse.

They also disciplined the children of migrant mothers by teaching them moral values, such as honesty and respect for the elders. Caregivers usually helped the children do their school assignments. All the caregivers interviewed described themselves as 'strict' regarding ensuring children's school attendance and academic performance. Marlie, 42 years old, explained how she motivated her migrant sister's children to study:

I told them that they were so lucky to have the financial support to study, unlike my sister and me. When we were students, we couldn't take exams in the school unless we paid our school fees. We begged the responsible person in school for us to be able to take the exam. I also told them, 'You have everything, one request to your parents, you get it'. I said those things to them because sometimes I observed that they did not concentrate much on their studies.

Caregivers also acted as intermediaries between migrant mothers and their children, keeping the mothers abroad updated by phone about their children's health, scholastic involvement, behaviour at home, and immediate needs. This role was particularly observable when migrant mothers were undocumented and could not easily return to the Philippines to visit their children. In cases of indefinite family separation during which migrant mothers' direct care provision was 'put on hold' due to the host country's restrictive policies amounting to an immobility regime (Brandhorst et al. 2020, p. 270; Bryceson 2019), the caregivers provided the main pillar of emotional support for the children, while reminding them about their mothers' sacrifices for them while working abroad.

Moreover, the caregivers interviewed received and budgeted the remittances of the migrant mothers. When there was an important family event to celebrate (birthdays, Christmas, New Year), they were the ones who organised parties or took the children to restaurants. The migrant mothers sent the necessary amount of money to cover the expenses for such a celebration. This arrangement was different when the migrant mother's husband lived in the same house as the caregiver. In such a case, he was the one who received the remittances and took care of the family budget and family celebrations. This arrangement aimed to prevent possible conflicts between him and his wife or between him and the Filipino caregiver; conflicts that scholars frequently observe in studies on transnational families (Shinozaki 2012).

Female caregivers occupy a particularly strategic position in families where the birth mother is working abroad, since it is their presence, availability, and acceptance of such a role that makes the migration of the Filipino mothers possible. Through their fulfilment of caregiving obligations, stay-behind families can function, while highly gender dichotomized familial patterns continue to thrive. Contrary to those who argue women's status can be

raised when they have earning power, the value of reproductive work is largely overlooked and remains in the hands of women family members, as demonstrated in other countries (Ducu 2020; Yarris 2017). Some stay-behind husbands participate in caregiving at home, but this is because they redefined their masculine identity (Fresnoza-Flot 2014; Hoang and Yeoh 2011).

8.6 The three-fold effects of shared caregiving arrangements

The conventional shared caregiving arrangement in the Filipino respondents' households combines economic benefits and constraints. The familial ties between caregivers and the migrant mothers in France put them together in an interdependent but unequal relationship, which affects their individual and familial lives. The relational asymmetry depends on who possesses the economic capital and who provides the assistance or service. It is through such asymmetry that the 'global care chains' reproduce inequalities between women. The respondents' interviews reveal how inequality permeates social and spatial mobility, family obligations, and emotional relationships.

8.6.1 Facilitated versus hampered mobility

Filipino migrant women in France gain financial autonomy and realise their life projects through immigration and domestic work (Mozère 2005b). Through their improved earnings, they experience upward social class mobility in their country of origin, whereas those with irregular migration status are trapped in spatial immobility and cannot risk visiting their children in the Philippines because once they leave France, they are unlikely to be given re-entry into France and be able resume their employment thereafter (Bryceson 2019). Under these circumstances, their migration facilitates their social class mobility, but hampers their geographical movements and physical contact with their children. Furthermore, this mixed and painfully awkward situation faced by Filipino migrant mothers had knock-on effects, detrimental as well as beneficial, for their caregivers back home.

All six interviewed caregivers recounted early experiences of poverty that they shared with their migrant daughter, sister, or daughter-in-law. They felt that the migration of the migrant mother would put an end to their own financial difficulties. The caregivers were

remunerated for their childcare role either directly (with a monthly salary sent to them by the migrant mothers) or indirectly (with gifts and financial support to their children's education as well as to their domestic expenses such as food, electricity, water, and apartment rent). Celia, 49-year-old single mother of two and elder sister of Nelia, described the advantages of caring for Nelia's son:

Working here (Nelia's household) has financially helped me a lot, particularly in supporting my grandchildren. I have two grandchildren, and their father (her son) has really no good job. Of course, I use my salary here to be able to support them.

In times of sickness, caregivers could request financial assistance from abroad. When the migrant mother returned for a vacation in the Philippines, she expressed her appreciation of the caregiver's care work with money top-ups, presents and outings to restaurants, cinemas and other special treats. In short, they could live comfortably and better provision their children's needs.

However, the interviewed caregivers found that their care role in migrant mothers' households constrained some of their movement and time to pursue other economic opportunities. Three caregivers had put aside their migration and professional plans. Many experienced curtailed time with their own children as described in the next section.

The caregivers faced security hazards as well. Having a family member working abroad conveys an impression of wealth to people in the neighbourhood, increasing the risk of burglary. Prevention required special safeguards. Melinda, the 69-year-old mother-in-law of Vangie, locked the gate of their household compound every evening at 8 pm. She also forbade Vangie's children going out at night. Inadvertently, having a migrant mother in the extended family imposed constraints on spatial mobility and disturbance to the tranquility of family members, including her caregiver.

Global care chains simultaneously link and affect migrant women and their co-mothers; and the relative economic benefits that accrue to them are unequal. Some migrant mothers' irregular migration status in France seriously limited their geographical mobility, whereas the spatial immobility of Filipino caregivers combined with social class immobility. The Philippines-based caretakers were socially immobile compared to the migrant mothers

in France. Most significantly, the caregivers' financial rewards from their caregiving work were not sufficient to increase their capacity to accumulate socially valorised properties like cars and houses, that many migrant mothers were able to purchase with their savings. Filipino carers accessed a relatively small portion of the migrant mothers' French earnings, albeit they usually earned more than other non-remittance-receiving women in the locality.

8.6.2 Increased family obligations

Studies on women's migration abroad have revealed various patterns of transnational caring practices directed at their stay-behind families involving: mothering, maintaining conjugal relations, and kin-sharing through remittance and gift sending, phone and internet communication and visits to see their children in the country of origin when their migration status is clear of legal barriers to entry back into France (Acedera and Yeoh 2021; Baldassar and Merla 2014; Alicea 1997; Zontini 2004).

Similarly, the Filipino caregivers interviewed found that their family duties increased after the migration of their daughter, sister, or daughter-in-law, being responsible for ensuring the wellbeing of the migrant mothers' children. Having children of their own to take care of made the situation even more complicated. Three of the study respondents experienced stress from 'double mothering'. The caregiving role of Celia in the Philippines led to physical separation from her own child, paralleling what had happened to her migrant sister when she left her children to work in France. Celia lamented:

It was hard, really hard. Every time I went to bed at night, I had tears in my eyes. When I woke up in the morning, it was the same. I was separated from my children until the time my eldest daughter graduated from high school. ... I generally returned home and visited my children in October or December, when Jojo (her nephew) wasn't attending school. But when he went to school, it was difficult to go to the countryside. I needed to take care of him and supervise his studies. I could only return home during school vacation, the only time when I saw my children.

Celia's experience demonstrates the possibility of adverse outcomes from the 'double mothering' of global care chains, linking migrant mothers and caregivers. The emotional care that women carers would otherwise give to their children is transformed into mainly material forms of care stemming from their paid care labour in the household of a mother possessing superior economic resources than them. As Hochschild (2002, p. 17) observes, the indirect care mothers receive 'gold' (financial remuneration) in exchange for their 'labour of love' to someone else's child.

The other two caregivers who had children of their own, namely Marlie and Maria (37-year-old single mother of three), confided that they had different mothering approaches towards their children as opposed to their migrant relative's children. Marlie was stricter than Maria when it came to disciplining her migrant sister's children:

I had more fear for my sister's children than for my own kids. I told them that I had more worries for them than for my children because my kids were mine. Nobody could reproach me for how I looked after them.

Like Marlie, other interviewed caregivers were anxious to avoid the migrant mother's reproaches and preserve her trust in them. Even though migrant mothers left the carers free to adopt their own mothering strategies towards their stay-behind children, the caregivers preferred to consult their mothers' regularly concerning such matters. But when they encountered difficulties, they tried to keep it in their own hands without asking for help. They avoided making appeals for anything from the migrant mothers though the migrant mothers always asked them what they needed. What the carers mostly shared with the migrant mothers was the information that their children missed them. Likewise, the migrant mothers in France often concealed their problems from the carers and even their children and husband. Such a communication gap among family members appears to be common in transnational families (Schmalzbauer 2008; Fresnoza-Flot 2013).

8.6.3 Emotional proximity versus distance

Maternal migration has been shown to affect both the migrant mother and her children left in the country of origin (Asis 2006; Bryant 2005). Some migrant mothers compensate for their remote relationship with their children by focusing their attention on their employer's offspring. Yet some interviewed Filipino mothers tried to hide their affection for the children they were employed to look after, while experiencing no opportunities to provide emotional support for their own children. Such double emotional suffering could also be observed among their children's caregivers back home.

All six of the Filipino caregivers had taken care of their migrant relatives' children prior to their mothers' migration to France. Four respondents acted as caregivers for their sisters who worked to sustain the extended family, while two became caregivers to the children of their daughter and daughter-in-law who went abroad to work in other countries before France. For instance, Maria shared her early caregiving experience with her sister Natie: 'I'm the one who took care of Iza when Natie worked. Iza called me "mama Marie". She's very sweet, and yes, she mostly grew up with me'. The closeness between the caregivers and the children of their migrant relatives developed intensely following the latter's migration. The migrant mothers' children tended to share more of their problems with their caregivers than their biological mothers. When they needed something, they confided in the caregivers, who in turn relayed the message to the migrant mothers.

Such a close relationship between the caregivers and the children they took care of developed particularly strongly if the child was still an infant at the time of his or her mother's migration. Celia, for instance, became the caregiver of her one-year-and-half nephew after her youngest sister Nelia went to France. Since Nelia was an irregular migrant and could not go back to the Philippines, Celia acted like her nephew's 'real mother' during seventeen uninterrupted years. As a result, she and her nephew became very close to each other. When Nelia returned for the first time to the Philippines after her migration status was regularised in France, she and her son underwent a problematic adaptation process. He was uncomfortable and shy towards her. Nelia discovered both emotional and ideological distance between her and her son. As Falikov (2005) points out, migrant parents' reunification with their children after long years of separation is more like a meeting between strangers than a family reunion (p. 401).

The caregiver also passes through a challenging stage during the migrant mother's first visit at home. Celia, for instance, experienced ambivalent feelings: on the one hand, she

wanted to distance herself from her nephew in order to leave more space for her sister; on the other hand, she had the strong impulse to stay by his side. Aiming not to hurt the feelings of her sister, Celia decided to give way, despite feeling emotional pain in doing so.

Another example is that of Lucia, 57 years old and single, who was a caregiver working for her migrant sister in Germany before becoming a caregiver towards the children of her other migrant sister in France. She confided that she was emotionally torn apart when the first group of children she looked after left her to join their mother in Germany. Despite her sadness, she did not impede her separation from the children. Like migrant mothers who control their feelings towards the children they look after to avoid jealousy of their employer, caregivers back home try to moderate their emotional sentiments and maintain their relationship of trust with the migrant mother.

Hence, women in the global care chains control their feelings and emotions in accordance with the power relations they maintain among themselves, and the social or biological ties that link them. They often occupy ambivalent positions tied to their interdependent and asymmetrical relationships with one another. In many cases, children have become a linking factor among these women in the so-called 'international transfer of caretaking' (Parreñas 2000, p. 561). They simultaneously link 'First World' women (the employer) and their migrant domestic workers (the employee) from the 'Third World' countries, with migrant women and their caregivers back home. Such linkages involve emotional ramifications affecting for all women and children along the care chain.

8.7 Discussion and conclusion

Filipino maternal migration would not be possible without women kin who are ready to assume a caregiving role within the migrant mothers' households and who make 'ritualised family practices' possible across borders (Martínez this volume). This chapter highlights the strong links between women within the Filipino extended family — between sisters, mothers and daughters, or between mothers-in-law and daughters-in-law through the analytical lens of 'global care chains'. It also captures the interdependent but unequal power relations amongst them, notably between migrant mothers and their caregivers, that offer them both opportunities and constraints.

The empirical data examined here provide answers to the three research questions posed at the beginning of this chapter. Concerning how Filipino migrant mothers and their children's caregivers experience domestic care work, the chapter shows that migrants encountered emotional challenges when dealing with their women employers who relied on their care of their children. The migrant mothers needed emotional restraint to discipline their sentiments and avoid friction with their employers.

Similar tensions occurred along the chain between migrant mothers and the Filipino carers of their children. Successful management of their emotional challenges was facilitated by the women's collective experience of poverty during their early lives, which underpinned their familial relations and 'bounded solidarity' (Portes and Sensenbrenner 1993). This sense of solidarity inspired them to pursue the commonly-held objective of social class mobility. The aim required cooperation and active participation between the migrant mothers and their chosen caregivers. Mutual trust reinforced the solidarity of family members and was foundational to the success of mothers' migratory projects. Despite the tensions of shared mothering arrangements, the relationship of trust generally persisted between migrant mothers and their caregivers.

On the other hand, the chapter demonstrates the undesirable side of 'bounded solidarity' in the 'global care chains' in which the study respondents were involved. One of the paradoxical effects of 'bounded solidarity' on careworkers in shared mothering arrangements in the Philippines is that it can hamper their spatial mobility. Yet, given their individual needs, migrant mothers and their caregivers maintain an interdependent relationship based on 'enforceable trust' (Portes 1998), which partly explains how migrant mothers and their caregivers can withstand the emotional consequences of their shared mothering arrangements.

Finally, tracing 'global care chains' framework, the unequal power relation between Filipino migrant mothers and their children's caregivers emerges and helps to identify the factor connecting them to each other, namely the children who receive their care. Global care chains connect not only women but also their children. The chain is fundamentally imbued with the needs, sense of purpose and sentiments of its 'service-providers and service-recipients' (Hochschild 2000, p. 132). How children experience the unequal power relations alongside direct and indirect women carers of the global care chains, and how they

position themselves within such dynamics constitute two aspects worthy of being examined for future research on mothering in the migration context.

Acknowledgements

I am grateful to Maryse Tripier for her guidance and all-out support throughout the doctoral research from which this chapter originated. The earlier version of this paper was presented during the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences (FASoS) colloquium at Maastricht University on 17 April 2013. I thank Valentina Mazzucato for her invitation to present my research findings at FASoS and for her insightful remarks. I also thank the editors of this volume, Javiera Cienfuegos Illanes, Rosa Brandhorst and Deborah Bryceson, for inviting me to be part of this publication adventure.

References

- Acedera, K. F., & Yeoh, B. S. (2021). When care is near and far: Care triangles and the mediated spaces of mobile phones among Filipino transnational families. *Geoforum*, 121, 181-191.
- Aguilar, F. V. (2009). *Maalwang buhay: family, overseas migration, and cultures of relatedness in Barangay Paraiso*. Quezon City: Ateneo de Manila University Press.
- Åkesson, L., Jørgen, C., & Drotbohm, H. (2012). Mobility, moralities and motherhood: Navigating the contingencies of Cape Verdean lives. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 38(2), 237-260.
- Alicea, M. (1997). "A chambered nautilus": The contradictory nature of Puerto Rican women's role in the social construction of a transnational community. *Gender & Society*, 11(5), 597-626.
- Anggraeni, D. (2006). *Dreamseekers: Indonesian women as domestic workers in Asia*. Jakarta: Equinox Publishing.
- Asis, M. M. B. (2006). Living with migration. Experiences of left-behind children in the Philippines. *Asian Population Studies*, 2(1), 45-67.
- Baldassar, L., & Merla, L. (Eds.). (2014). *Transnational families, migration and the circulation of care. Understanding mobility and absence in family life*. Abingdon and New York: Routledge.

- Boccagni, P. (2012). Practising motherhood at a distance: Retention and loss in Ecuadorian transnational families. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 38(2), 261-277.
- Brandhorst, R., Baldassar, L., & Wilding, R. (2020). Introduction to the Special Issue: "Transnational family care 'on hold'? Intergenerational relationships and obligations in the context of immobility regimes". *Journal of Intergenerational Relationships*, 18(3), 261-280.
- Bryant, J. (2005). *Children of international migrants in Indonesia, Thailand, and the Philippines: A review of evidence and policies*. Florence: UNICEF Innocenti Research Centre.
- Bryceson, D.F. (2019) Transnational families negotiating migration and care life cycles across nation-state borders. In Bryceson, D.F. (ed.) *Transnational families in global migration: Navigating economic development and life cycles across blurred and brittle borders*. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 45(16), 3042-3064.
- Carling, J., Schmalzbauer, L., & Menjivar, C. (2012). Central themes in the study of transnational parenthood. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 38(2), 191-217.
- Cienfuegos Illanes, J. (2010). Migrant mothers and divided homes: perceptions of immigrant Peruvian women about motherhood. *Journal of Comparative Family Studies*, 41(2), 205-224.
- Commission on Filipinos Overseas. (2011). *Number of registered Filipino emigrants by sex: 1981-2010*. http://www.cfo.gov.ph/images/stories/pdf/by_sex.pdf. Accessed 10 September 2011.
- Collins, P. H. (1994). Shifting the center: Race, class, and feminist theorising about motherhood. In E. Nakano Glenn, G. Chang, & L. R. Forcey (Ed.), *Mothering ideology, experience, and agency* (pp. 45-65). New York: Routledge.
- Connell, J., & Stilwell, B. (2006). Merchants of medical care: Recruiting agencies in the global health care chain. In C. Kuptsch (Ed.), *Merchants of labour* (pp. 239-253). Geneva: International Labour Organization (International Institute for Labour Studies).
- Dankyi, E., Mazzucato, V., & Manuh, T. (2017). Reciprocity in global social protection: Providing care for migrants' children. *Oxford Development Studies*, 45(1), 80-95.
- Dreby, J. (2007). Children and power in Mexican transnational families. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 69(4), 1050-1064.

- Dreby, J. (2010). *Divided by borders. Mexican migrants and their children*. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Ducu, V. (2020). Displaying grandparenting within Romanian transnational families. *Global Networks*, 20(2), 380-395.
- Falikov, C. J. (2005). Emotional transnationalism and family identities. *Family Process*, 44(4), 399-406.
- Foamete-Ducu, V. (2011). *Strategies of transnational motherhood: the case of Romanian women*. PhD thesis, Babes-Bolyai University.
- Fresnoza-Flot, A. (2009). Migration status and transnational mothering: The case of Filipino migrants in France. *Global networks*, 9(2), 252-270.
- Fresnoza-Flot, A. (2013). *Mères migrantes sans frontières. La dimension invisible de l'immigration philippine en France* [Migrant mothers without borders. The invisible dimension of Filipino immigration to France]. Paris: L'Harmattan.
- Fresnoza-Flot, A. (2014). Men's caregiving practices in Filipino transnational families: A case study of left-behind fathers and sons. In L. Baldassar & L. Merla (Eds.), *Transnational families, migration and the circulation of care. Understanding mobility and absence in family life* (pp. 170-184). Abingdon and New York: Routledge.
- Fresnoza-Flot, A., & Nagasaka, I. (2021). Lingering caregiver-child relations across borders: Filipino migrant youths in Europe and their stay-behind carers in the Philippines. *Zero-a-seis*, 23(43), 889-914.
- Gamburd, M. (2010). *Sri Lankan migration to the Gulf: female breadwinners - domestic workers*. Middle East Institute. <http://www.mei.edu/content/sri-lankan-migration-gulf-female-breadwinners-domestic-workers>. Accessed 2 May 2021.
- Hoang, L. A., & Yeoh, B. S. A. (2011). Breadwinning wives and "left-behind" husbands: Men and masculinities in the Vietnamese transnational family. *Gender & Society*, 25(6), 717-739.
- Hochschild, A. R. (2000). Global care chains and emotional surplus value. In W. Hutton & A. Giddens (Eds.), *On the edge. Living with global capitalism* (pp. 130-146). London: Jonathan Cape.
- Hochschild, A. R. (2002). Love and gold. In B. Ehrenreich & A. R. Hochschild (Eds.), *Global woman: Nannies, maids and sex workers in the new economy* (pp. 15-30). London: Granta Books.

- Hondagneu-Sotelo, P., & Avila, E. (1997). "I'm here, but I'm there": The meanings of Latina transnational motherhood. *Gender & Society*, 11(5), 548-571.
- Hondagneu-Sotelo, P. (2007). *Doméstica. Immigrant workers cleaning and caring in the shadows of affluence*. California: University of California Press.
- Isaksen, L., Uma, D., & Hochschild, A. R. (2008). Global care crisis. Mother and child's-eye view. *Sociologia, Problemas e Praticas*, 56, 61-83.
- Ito, R. (2016). Negotiating partial citizenship under neoliberalism: Regularization struggles among Filipino domestic workers in France (2008–2012). *International Journal of Japanese Sociology*, 25(1), 69-84.
- Lahaie, C., Hayes, J. A., Piper, T. M., & Heymann, J. (2009). Work and family divided across borders: The impact of parental migration on Mexican children in transnational families. *Community, Work & Family*, 12(3), 299-312.
- Lan, P.-C. (2003). "Maid or madam? Filipina migrant workers and the continuity of domestic labor. *Gender Society*, 17(2), 187-208.
- Lutz, H. (2002). At your service madam! The globalization of domestic service. *Feminist Review*, 70(1), 89-104.
- Lutz, H. (Ed.). (2016). *Migration and domestic work. A European perspective on a global theme*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Madianou, M., & Miller, D. (2011). Mobile phone parenting: Reconfiguring relationships between Filipina migrant mothers and their left-behind children. *New Media & Society*, 13(3), 457-470.
- Mazzucato, V., & Schans, D. (2011). Transnational families and the well-being of children: Conceptual and methodological challenges. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 73(4), 704-712.
- Mazzucato, V., Cebotari, V., Veale, A., White, A. & Grassi, M. (2015). International parental migration and the psychological well-being of children in Ghana, Nigeria, and Angola. *Social Science & Medicine*, 132, 215-224.
- Moon, S. (2003). Immigration and mothering: Case studies from two generations of Korean immigrant women. *Gender & Society*, 1(6), 840-860.
- Moran-Taylor, M. J. (2008). When mothers and fathers migrate north: caretakers, children, and child rearing in Guatemala. *Latin American Perspectives*, 35(4), 79-95.

- Mozère, L. (2005). Domestiques philippines entrepreneures d'elles-mêmes sur un marché mondial de la domesticité [Filipino migrant women domestic worker entrepreneurs themselves in the global market of domesticity]. *Le Portique*.
<http://leportique.revues.org/711>. Accessed 4 May 2021.
- Mozère, L. (2005b). Filipina women as domestic workers in Paris. A transnational labour market enabling the fulfilment of a life project? In E. Spaan, F. Hillmann, & T.v. Naerssen. *Asian migrants and European labour markets. Patterns and processes of immigrant labour market insertion in Europe* (pp. 177-194). Oxon and New York: Routledge.
- Nagasaka, I. (1998). Kinship networks and child fostering in labor migration from Ilocos, Philippines to Italy. *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal*, 7(1), 67-92.
- Pantea, M.-C. (2012). Grandmothers as main caregivers in the context of parental migration. *European Journal of Social Work*, 15(1), 63-80.
- Parreñas, R. S. (2005). *Children of global migration: Transnational families and gendered woes*. California: Stanford University Press.
- Parreñas, R. S. (2000). Migrant Filipina domestic workers and the international division of reproductive labor. *Gender & Society*, 14(4), 560-581.
- Parreñas, R. S. (2001). *Servants of globalization. Women, migration and domestic work*. California: Stanford University Press.
- Piper, N. (2009). The complex interactions of the migration-development nexus: A social perspective. *Population, Space and Place* 15(2), 93-111.
- Plaza, D. (2000). Transnational grannies: The changing family responsibilities of elderly African Caribbean-born women resident in Britain. *Social Indicators Research*, 51, 75-105.
- Poeze, M., Dankyi, E. K., & Mazzucato, V. (2016). Navigating transnational childcare relationships: Migrant parents and their children's caregivers in the origin country. *Global Networks*, 17(1), 111-129.
- Portes, A. (1998). Social capital: Its origins and applications in modern sociology. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 24, 1-24.
- Portes, A., & Sensenbrenner, J. (1993). Embeddedness and immigration: Notes on the social determinants of economic action. *American Journal of Sociology*, 98(6), 1320-1350.

- Raijman, R., Schammah-Gesser, S., & Kemp, A. (2003). International migration, domestic work, and care work: Undocumented Latina migrants in Israel. *Gender & Society*, 17(5), 727-749.
- Reyes, M. M. (2008). *Migration and Filipino children left-behind: A literature review*. Manila: Miriam College - Women and Gender Institute (WAGI) & United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF).
- Save the Children. (2006). *Left behind, left out: The impact on children and families of mothers migrating for work abroad*. Colombo: Save the Children.
- Schmalzbauer, L. (2004). Searching for wages and mothering from afar: The case of Honduran transnational families. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 66(5), 1317-1331.
- Schmalzbauer, L. (2008). Family divided: The class formation of Honduran transnational families. *Global Networks*, 8(3), 329-346.
- Shinozaki, K. (2012). In the absence of mothers: Fathers' on-site parenting in the global care chains and their dependent migration from the Philippines to Germany. Conference *Transforming gender orders. Intersections of care, family and migration*. Frankfurt.
- Tilly, C. (2007). Trust networks in transnational migration. *Sociological Forum*, 22(1), 3-24.
- Toro-Morn, M. I. (1995). Gender, class, family, and migration: Puerto Rican women in Chicago. *Gender & Society*, 9(6), 712-726.
- Yarris, K. E. (2017). *Care across generations: Solidarity and sacrifice in transnational families*. California: Stanford University Press.
- Yeates, N. (2005). A global political economy of care. *Social Policy and Society*, 4(2), 227-234.
- Zontini, E. (2004). Immigrant women in Barcelona: Coping with the consequences of transnational lives. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 30(6), 1113-1144.