



Brazil's caves, home to diverse species and minerals, were stripped of protections by a recent presidential decree.

Edited by Jennifer Sills

Brazilian cave heritage under siege

Under President Jair Bolsonaro, Brazil has neglected environmental protection (1). Until recently, subterranean environments were largely safeguarded; although some caves could be destroyed for the purposes of exploiting mineral resources or urban development, those classified as presenting maximum cultural, geological, and/or biological value had to be preserved (2). However, a January presidential decree (3) allows the destruction of even those caves with maximum relevance, representing a substantial step backward for subterranean conservation.

The new decree ignores the irreplaceable scientific value of Brazilian caves. Researchers have documented hundreds of endemic obligate cave species, including animals with unique adaptations (4). Thousands of species still lack formal descriptions, and many more species await discovery. At least 72 bat species roost in Brazilian caves and provide critical ecosystem services such as pest control (5). The geodiversity of these caves is also exceptional, with many sites harboring rare minerals and geological formations found nowhere else (6). Finally, the

multitude of archeological and paleontological cave sites across the country provide a unique record of Brazil's past.

Bolsonaro's decree increases the extinction risk of unique species. By ignoring the intrinsic and utilitarian values of Brazilian caves, the policy neglects global conservation strategies to safeguard the subterranean biome (7, 8), violates the principles of both the Federal Biodiversity Policy (9) and the Convention on Biological Diversity (10), and fails to align with Sustainable Development Goals. The potential losses of unique species, ecosystem services, and new industrial chemicals (which could be derived from the microbes found in the caves) (11) are unpredictable. In addition, because causing species extinction could damage a company's reputation, the policy could undermine the mining sector that the administration seeks to support. We cannot allow these ecosystems to be obliterated by short-sighted decrees.

Rodrigo Lopes Ferreira^{1*}, Enrico Bernard², Francisco William da Cruz Júnior³, Luis Beethoven Piló², Allan Calux⁴, Marconi Souza-Silva¹, Jos Barlow⁵, Paulo S. Pompeu⁶, Pedro Cardoso⁷, Stefano Mammola^{7,8}, and 85 additional authors†

¹Centro de Estudos em Biologia Subterrânea, Departamento de Ecologia e Conservação, Universidade Federal de Lavras, Lavras, MG 37200-900, Brazil. ²Laboratório de Ciência Aplicada à Conservação da Biodiversidade,

Departamento de Zoologia, Universidade Federal de Pernambuco, Recife, PE 50670-901, Brazil.

³Instituto de Geociências, Universidade de São Paulo, São Paulo, SP 05508-080, Brazil.

⁴Carstografica, Karst Applied Research Centre, Belo Horizonte, MG 31170-320, Brazil. ⁵Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster, UK. ⁶Departamento de Ecologia e

Conservação, Universidade Federal de Lavras, Lavras, MG, Brazil. ⁷Laboratory for Integrative Biodiversity Research, Finnish Museum of Natural History (Luomus), University of Helsinki, Helsinki, Finland. ⁸Molecular Ecology Group, Water Research Institute, National Research Council (CNR-IRSA), Verbania Pallanza, Italy.

*Corresponding author. Email: drops@uffla.br

†Full list of authors and affiliations can be found at www.science.org/doi/10.1126/science.abo1973.

REFERENCES AND NOTES

- H. Escobar. *Science*, 10.1126/science.aay9103 (2019).
- Decreto nº 6.640, de 07 de novembro de 2008 (2008); www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/_Ato2007-2010/2008/Decreto/D6640.htm [in Portuguese].
- Decreto nº 10.935, de 12 de janeiro de 2022 (2022); www.in.gov.br/en/web/dou/-/decreto-n-10.935-de-12-de-janeiro-de-2022-373591582 [in Portuguese].
- K. Yoshizawa *et al.*, *Curr. Biol.* **24**, 9 (2014).
- R. A. Medellín, R. Wiederholt, L. Lopez-Hoffman, *Biol. Conserv.* **211**, 45 (2017).
- C. J. Schenk, R. J. Viger, C. P. Anderson, "Maps showing geology, oil, and gas fields and geologic provinces of the South America region: U.S. Geological Survey Open-File Report 97-470-D" (1999); <https://pubs.er.usgs.gov/publication/ofr97470D>.
- J. J. Wynne *et al.*, *Conserv. Lett.* **14**, e12834 (2021).
- D. Sánchez-Fernández *et al.*, *Nat. Clim. Change* **11**, 458 (2021).
- Decreto nº 4.339 de 22 de agosto de 2002 (2002); www.planalto.gov.br/ccivil_03/decreto/2002/D4339.htm [in Portuguese].

10. Convention on Biological Diversity (www.cbd.int).
 11. P. N. da Costa Souza *et al.*, *Afr. J. Microbiol. Res.* **7**, 483 (2013).

10.1126/science.abo1973

Brazil's mangroves: Natural carbon storage

Brazil has the second-largest area of mangrove cover in the world (1), including the world's largest continuous mangroves (2). These ecosystems provide food security for coastal populations; habitat for terrestrial, bird, and fish species; and carbon sequestration (3). However, Brazil's mangroves are in peril. In 2020, the Brazilian government approved legislation that would have eliminated mangrove protection for the benefit of real estate development (4). Fortunately, in December 2021, the Brazilian Supreme Court found the controversial policy unconstitutional (5). Brazil must continue to protect its mangroves despite an administration that has shown disregard for the environment (6).

Mangrove conservation doubles as an effective natural climate solution (7). Mangroves can store up to 10 times more carbon per hectare than upland forests (8), and Brazil's mangrove soil currently stores about 3 to 8% of global carbon (9). Yet these ecosystems and their vast natural carbon storage potential are vulnerable to emissions from anthropogenic activities and, if lost, could not be restored by 2050 (10).

The attempts to change legislation to prioritize development over mangroves demonstrate that current protections are threatened. Including Brazil's mangroves in the national Reducing Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD) strategy could be a way to maintain the carbon stocks and better protect their biodiversity. Although there is a civil society initiative for monitoring Brazilian mangroves (11, 12), Brazil should also create an official monitoring program to ensure effective conservation and enforcement of the policies in place to protect these ecosystems.

Denilson da S. Bezerra^{1*}, Adriano de Lima Santos¹, Janaina Santos Bezerra¹, Silvana Amaral², Milton Kampel², Liana O. Anderson³, Flávia Rebelo Moche¹, Jorge Luiz Silva Nunes¹, Naíla Arraes de Araujo¹, Larissa Nascimento Barreto¹, Maria do S. S. Pinheiro¹, Marcio José Celeri¹, Fabrício B. Silva⁴, Alexsandro Mendonça Viegas⁵, Stella Manes⁶, Taíssa C. S. Rodrigues⁷, Josué C. Viegas⁸, Ulisses D. V. Souza⁹, André L. S. Santos¹⁰, Celso H. L. Silva-Junior^{2,11}

¹Universidade Federal do Maranhão, São Luís, Maranhão, Brazil. ²Instituto Nacional de Pesquisas Espaciais, São José dos Campos, São Paulo, Brazil.

³Centro de Monitoramento e Alertas de Dessastres Naturais, São José dos Campos, São Paulo,

Brazil. ⁴Universidade Ceuma, São Luís, Maranhão, Brazil. ⁵Escola de Governo do Maranhão, São Luís, Maranhão, Brazil. ⁶Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil. ⁷Universidade Estadual da Região Tocantina do Maranhão, Imperatriz, Maranhão, Brazil. ⁸Universidade de Coimbra, Coimbra, Portugal. ⁹Colégio Universitário da Universidade Federal do Maranhão, São Luís, Maranhão, Brazil. ¹⁰Instituto Federal de Educação, Ciência e Tecnologia do Maranhão, São Luís, Maranhão, Brazil. ¹¹Universidade Estadual do Maranhão, São Luís, Maranhão, Brazil.

*Corresponding author.

Email: denilson.bezerra@ufma.br

REFERENCES AND NOTES

- M. Spalding, *World Atlas of Mangroves* (Routledge, 2010).
- W. R. Nascimento *et al.*, *Estuar. Coast. Shelf Sci.* **117**, 83 (2013).
- S. Y. Lee *et al.*, *Glob. Ecol. Biogeogr.* **23**, 726 (2014).
- A. C. Amaral, "Salles atacará normas de proteção de terras, águas e ar em revogação nesta segunda" (2020); <https://ambiencia.blogfolha.uol.com.br/2020/09/27/salles-atacara-normas-de-protecao-de-terras-aguas-e-ar-em-revogacao-nesta-segunda> [in Portuguese].
- P. Watanabe, "STF restaura proteção a mangues e restingas, por unanimidade" (2021); <https://www1.folha.uol.com.br/ambiente/2021/12/stf-restaura-protecao-a-mangues-e-restingas-por-unanimidade.shtml> [in Portuguese].
- F. P. Ottoni *et al.*, *Biota Neotrop.* **21**, 2 (2021).
- P. I. Macreadie *et al.*, *Nat. Rev. Earth Environ.* **2**, 826 (2021).
- J. Howard *et al.*, *Front. Ecol. Environ.* **15**, 42 (2017).
- V. Hatje *et al.*, *Limnol. Oceanogr.* **66**, 321 (2021).
- M. L. Noon *et al.*, *Nat. Sustain.* **5**, 37 (2022).
- C. M. Souza *et al.*, *Remote Sens.* **12**, 2735 (2020).
- C. Diniz *et al.*, *Remote Sens.* **11**, 808 (2019).

10.1126/science.abo4578

Disrupting targets' dependency on bullies

Targets of academic bullying sometimes despair about the lack of institutional support they receive. Even when universities take a firm stance against perpetrators [e.g., (1, 2)], it is very difficult to disrupt the dependency of the target on the bully. Institutions must put policies in place to allow targets to extricate themselves and their work from the perpetrator without compromising their careers.

To address the issue of academic bullying, many recommendations focus on punishing perpetrators (e.g., prohibiting the known bullies from leading labs), which is in line with domestic abuse legislation in some countries, such as Austria (3). However, simply removing the bully does not protect the target from their influence. Another common solution is to transfer targets to another lab (4–7), but many targets do not perceive this as a viable option; after years trying to pursue their research goals, changing labs would mean losing their projects, associated publications, and access to letters of

recommendation, which can be career-breaking for early-stage academics.

The scientific community must implement policies that grant targets of bullying independence. For example, if the allegations of bullying behaviors are validated (e.g., through confirmation by institutional investigation committees), institutions can grant the targets the rights to the lab's data, allowing them to publish. Institutions can also ban the perpetrators from submitting letters of recommendation for targets and designate others, such as department chairs, to write such letters instead. Medical students, PhD students, and postdocs should have the right to independently pursue research and publication projects when supervisors are known to engage in bullying behaviors. This would serve as a fail-safe for situations in which the career success of the target would otherwise be contingent on staying in a bully's group.

Granting bullying targets these rights would allow them to protect their mental health without sacrificing their professional success. If lab members knew that they could continue their work independently, they would likely tolerate fewer bullying behaviors. Empowerment would lower the bar to reporting inappropriate behavior as well. Protecting targets is crucial to stemming the tide of academic bullying behavior.

Susanne Täuber^{1*} and Morteza Mahmoudi²

¹Department of Human Resource Management & Organizational Behavior, University of Groningen, Groningen, Netherlands. ²Department of Radiology and Precision Health Program, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI 48824, USA.

*Corresponding author. Email: s.tauber@rug.nl

REFERENCES AND NOTES

- C. Flaherty, "No more passing the harasser," *Inside Higher Education* (2018); www.insidehighered.com/news/2018/09/25/u-wisconsin-system-proceeds-plan-disclose-misconduct-findings-against-employees.
- M. N. Bolotnikova, "Jorge Domínguez loses emeritus status after misconduct investigation," *Harvard Magazine* (2019). www.harvardmagazine.com/2019/05/jorge-dominguez-loses-emeritus-status.
- B. Haller, "The Austrian legislation against domestic violence" (2005); www.ikf.ac.at/english/austrian_legislation_against_domestic_violence.pdf.
- J. Stebbing *et al.*, *Postgrad. Med. J.* **80**, 93 (2004).
- L. Yarwood-Ross, C. Haigh, *Nurse Res.* **24**, 38 (2014).
- K. H. Hunter, K. Devine, *Int. J. Doct. Stud.* **11**, 35 (2016).
- S. Moss, M. Mahmoudi, *EclinicalMedicine* **40**, 101121 (2021).

COMPETING INTERESTS

S.T. is a member of the advisory board at the Academic Parity Movement (www.paritymovement.org), a nonprofit organization dedicated to addressing academic discrimination, violence, and incivility. M.M. is a cofounder and director of the Academic Parity Movement and receives royalties/honoraria for his published books, plenary lectures, and licensed patents.

10.1126/science.abo3412

Brazilian cave heritage under siege

Rodrigo Lopes FerreiraEnrico BernardFrancisco William da Cruz JúniorLuis Beethoven PilóAllan CaluxMarconi Souza-SilvaJos BarlowPaulo S. PompeuPedro CardosoStefano MammolaAlejandro Martínez GarcíaWilliam R. JefferyWilliam ShearRodrigo A. MedellínJ. Judson WynnePaulo A. V. BorgesYoshitaka KamimuraTanja PipanNadja Zupan HajnaAlberto SendraStewart PeckBogdan P. OnacDavid C. CulverHannelore HochJean-François FlotFabio StochMartina PavlekMatthew L. NiemillerShirish ManchiLouis DeharvengDanté FenolioJosé-María CalaforraJill YagerChristian GrieblerFadi Henri NaderWilliam F. HumphreysAlice C. HughesBrock FentonPaolo FortiFrancesco SauroGeorge VeniAmos FrumkinEfrat Gavish-RegevCene FišerPeter TronteljMaja ZagmajsterTeo DelicDiana M. P. Galassilaria VaccarelliMarjan KomnenovGuilherme GainettValeria da Cunha Tavares#ubomir Ková#Ana Z. MillerKazunori YoshizawaTiziana Di LorenzoOana T. MoldovanDavid Sánchez-FernándezSoumia MoutaouakilFrancis HowarthHelena BilandžijaTvrko DražinaNikolina Kuhari#Valerija ButoracCharles LienhardSteve J. B. CooperDavid EmeAndré Menezes StraussMattia SaccòYahui ZhaoPaul WilliamsMingyi TianKrizler TanalgoKyung-Sik WooMiran BarjakovicGary F. McCrackenNancy B SimmonsPaul A. RaceyDerek FordJosé Ayrton LabegaliniNivaldo ColzatoMaria João Ramos PereiraLudmilla M. S. AguiarRicardo MoratelliGerhard Du PreezAbel Pérez-GonzálezAna Sofia P. S. ReboleiraJohn GunnAnn Mc CartneyPaulo E. D. BobrowiecDmitry MilkoWanja KinuthiaErich FischerMelissa B. MeierhoferWinifred F Frick

Science, 375 (6586), • DOI: 10.1126/science.abo1973

View the article online

<https://www.science.org/doi/10.1126/science.abo1973>

Permissions

<https://www.science.org/help/reprints-and-permissions>

Use of this article is subject to the [Terms of service](#)

Science (ISSN 1095-9203) is published by the American Association for the Advancement of Science, 1200 New York Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20005. The title *Science* is a registered trademark of AAAS.

Copyright © 2022 The Authors, some rights reserved; exclusive licensee American Association for the Advancement of Science. No claim to original U.S. Government Works