FACULTÉ DES SCIENCES
PSYCHOLOGIQUES
ET DE L'ÉDUCATION
UNIVERSITÉ LIBRE DE BRUXELLES

The Coming Past

A social psychological approach of the uses of historical analogies and their effects in political contexts

Thesis presented by Djouaria Ghilani
with a view to obtaining the PhD Degree in Psychological and Educational Sciences ("Docteur en Sciences Psychologiques et de l' Éducation")
Academic year 2018-2019

Supervisor: Professor Olivier Klein
Co-supervisor: Professor Olivier Luminet
Center for Social and Cultural Psychology

Thesis jury:

Michel SYLIN (Université libre de Bruxelles, Chair)
Claudia TOMA (Université libre de Bruxelles, Secretary)
Michal BILEWICZ (University of Warsaw)
Emmanuelle DANBLON (Université libre de Bruxelles)
Valérie ROSOUX (Université catholique de Louvain)

fnrs
LA LIBERTÉ DE CHERCHER

Table of Contents

Acknowledgments 5

GENERAL INTRODUCTION 13

CHAPTER 1 16

An Introduction to Historical analogies 16

Introduction 17

What's in a name? 17

Analogies vs. Metaphors 18

Historical analogies vs. Uses of the past 20

A Brief History of Historical Analogies 22

The effects of historical analogies 27

(a) Representing the current situation 28

(b) Defining the roles of the actors 29

(c) Making decisions 31

(d) Persuading others 33

Conclusions 35

Summary of the chapter and implications 36

CHAPTER 2 38

From planets to particles: The broad field of analogical cognition 38

Analogical and case-based reasoning 40

Components of analogical reasoning 43

We need to talk about similarity 44

Analogical mapping 46

Structure Mapping Theory (SMT) 46

Summary of the chapter 50

CHAPTER 3 51

Rationale of the thesis and overview 51

CHAPTER 4 56

When History seems to repeat itself: 56

The influence of perceived lessons of the past on predictions about real-life events 56

Introduction 57

Historical Analogies: Their uses and effects 58

Lessons of the past for the future 60

Overview of studies 62

Availability of data, code and material 63

Studies 1 and 2 63

Sampling and Participants 64

Procedure 65

Measures 66

Results & Discussion 67

Study 3 75

Design & hypotheses 76

Participants & Procedure 77

Measures 78

Results & Discussion 81

Study 4 85

Design & Hypotheses 87
Sampling & Participants 88
Measures 88
Results & Discussion 90
Internal meta-analysis of the four studies 92
General discussion 94
Implications and future research 97

CHAPTER 5 99

Long live the past: 99

A multiple correspondence analysis of people's justifications for comparing the 2015 attacks in France to past events 99
Introduction 100
The uses of historical analogies 101
Selection of analogies 102
Present research 104
Method 105
Samples characteristics (N_{Total} = 835; $N_{9/11}$ = 518) 105
Procedure 107
Coding open answers 108
Socio-political variables 110
Results 112
Source Selection 112
Source interpretation 116
Multiple correspondence analysis 117
Interpretation of the MCA dimensional plane 121
Discussion 130
Limitations and future directions 135
Summary 136

CHAPTER 6 138

Look out, the past is right ahead! 138

A quantitative and qualitative analysis of the use of historical analogies in four Belgian newspapers during the 2014 Crimean crisis 138
Introduction 139
Historical analogies in media coverage 139
Overview of the present research 141
The Crimean crisis 142
Method 145
Newspapers selection and corpus compilation 145
Identifying analogies in articles 147
Identifying analogical sources 149
Results of the quantitative analysis 149
Results of the qualitative analysis 156
The Cold War 158
World War II (WWII) 161
Georgian War 164
Kosovo Independence 168
Discussion 171
Summary 177
Limitations and future directions 178

CHAPTER 7 181

General discussion **181**
Introduction **182**
Summary of the empirical findings 182
Supporting evidence for the typology 192
Which past is here? 194
Matters of context 197
The role of emotional factors in historical analogies 201
Limitations 205
Staying in the loop 208

REFERENCES **210**

APPENDICES **219**
APPENDIX 1. Perceived morality of past Germany and its actions in Study 2 **220**
APPENDIX 2. Distribution of current knowledge across the four experimental studies **221**
APPENDIX 3 Frequency of sources in CH Sample **222**
APPENDIX 4 Frequency of sources in FR Sample **224**
APPENDIX 5 Frequency of sources in GE Sample **225**
APPENDIX 6. Comparison categories obtained after coding participants' justifications for choosing analogies with specific past events **227**
APPENDIX 7. Frequency of sources in Crimean coverage **229**
APPENDIX 8. Number of mentions of the four most frequent historical analogies during the Crimean Crisis in March 2014 **232**
APPENDIX 9. The Case of McFaul vs. Geritz **233**
APPENDIX 10. A quote by former French Foreign Minister Bernard Kouchner **236**
APPENDIX 11. A quote by US President Barack Obama **236**
APPENDIX 12. Iraq and Kosovo as precedents **236**