



**UNIVERSITÉ
DE GENÈVE**

EU policy in the fight against trafficking in human beings

A representative example of the challenges caused by the externalisation of the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice

Chloé Brière

GEM PhD School
Centre for European Law (ULB)
Global Studies Institute (UNIGE)

Supervisors
Anne Weyembergh (ULB)
Robert Roth (UNIGE)

Thesis submitted June 24, 2016

In view to obtaining the doctoral degree at Université Libre de Bruxelles and
Université de Genève

Table of contents

Acknowledgments i
Table of contents ii
List of abbreviations vi

Introduction 1
I. Context of the research 1
A. Trafficking in human beings as a global challenge 1
B. Trafficking in human beings as a challenge for the European Union..... 5
II. Subject of the research 10
A. Research question 10
B. Clarification of key concepts 12
III. Methodology and structure..... 34

Chapter 1 – The externalisation process of the EU’s policy against trafficking in human beings 36

I. Introduction 36
II. The necessary identification of the Union’s counter-trafficking acquis..... 38
A. What is the acquis? Presentation of a concept 39
B. What is the acquis in the field of prevention and fight against THB?..... 60
C. Conclusions 74
III. External competences at the disposal of the European Union..... 75
A. Specificities of the Union’s external competences linked to the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice 76
B. The Union’s relevant express competences 80
C. The Union’s relevant implied competences 83
D. The quest for coherence and coordination 93
E. Conclusions 100
IV. The promotion of the Union’s counter-trafficking acquis through regional frameworks: an answer to the quest for coherence 100
A. Selection of the most relevant regional framework 102
B. Promotion of the fight against trafficking within policy documents 115
C. Promotion of the fight against THB within agreements 120
D. The support of regional cooperation 137
E. Conclusions 145
V. Conclusions 146

Chapter 2 – The integration of the European Union’s external policy into an ordered and pluralist counter-trafficking framework 149

- I. Introduction 149**
- II. The European Union’s commitment to multilateralism..... 152**
- III. A complex tapestry of actors..... 157**
 - A. Traditional multilateral actors: international and regional intergovernmental organisations..... 159
 - B. Non-traditional multilateral actors: private actors 171
 - C. A tapestry incomplete without mentioning States 176
 - D. Conclusion 179
- IV. Normative interactions preventing the risk of conflicts of norms 180**
 - A. Interactions leading to a common approach and objectives..... 182
 - B. Interactions leading to consistent standards..... 186
 - C. Conclusion: when ordered pluralism leads to harmonisation through alignment..... 192
- V. Mechanisms of coordination, instruments to foster cooperation and to avoid duplication of effort 194**
 - A. Internal coordination mechanisms in large organisations 195
 - B. Bilateral and multilateral mechanisms among partners..... 198
 - C. Importance of the coordination and cooperation efforts 210
- VI. Conclusion211**

Chapter 3 – Assessing the progress made in the implementation of a comprehensive approach in national legal orders 214

- I. Introduction 214**
- II. Methodology 217**
 - A. The choice of a comparative approach 217
 - B. Selection of national case studies..... 218
 - C. Data collection..... 223
 - D. Analysing the data 224
- III. Contextual information about the countries selected 226**
 - A. Trafficking in human beings in Belgium and Bosnia and Herzegovina..... 226
 - B. Obligations stemming from EU and other international standards 229
 - C. Concluding remarks..... 232
- IV. Criminalisation of trafficking in human beings, revealing the margin of discretion of States..... 233**
 - A. The offence of trafficking in human beings in Belgian law 234
 - B. The offence of trafficking in human beings in Bosnian law 243
 - C. Conclusions on the criminalisation of trafficking in human beings 251

<u>V.</u>	<u>Implementation of the duty to cooperate: a prerequisite for a comprehensive approach</u>	<u>252</u>
A.	The creation of coordinating bodies	253
B.	Duty to cooperate imposed on national public authorities	257
C.	Involvement of and cooperation with civil society organisations	266
D.	Monitoring by National Rapporteurs or equivalent mechanisms	273
E.	Concluding remarks	277
<u>VI.</u>	<u>Comprehensive approach in the prevention of trafficking in human beings</u>	<u>277</u>
A.	Collection of data and research	278
B.	Addressing demand through the criminalisation of the use of services provided by trafficking victims	282
C.	Concluding remarks	286
<u>VII.</u>	<u>Comprehensive approach in the prosecution of traffickers</u>	<u>286</u>
A.	Fighting trafficking with modern techniques	288
B.	Convictions and penalties imposed	294
C.	Cross-border cooperation in criminal matters	304
D.	Concluding remarks	323
<u>VIII.</u>	<u>Comprehensive approach in the protection of and assistance to victims of trafficking in human beings</u>	<u>323</u>
A.	Clause of non-prosecution or non-punishment of victims	325
B.	Mechanisms for the protection and assistance of victims of trafficking in human beings	328
C.	Cross-border cooperation in the protection of victims	335
D.	Concluding remarks	341
<u>IX.</u>	<u>Conclusion</u>	<u>342</u>
	Conclusion	345
<u>I.</u>	<u>Recapitulation of the main arguments</u>	<u>345</u>
A.	The external competences of the European Union and their use in practice	345
B.	The integration of the European Union in a multi-level governance	347
C.	The implementation at national level of European and international standards	348
<u>II.</u>	<u>Answer to the research question</u>	<u>349</u>
<u>III.</u>	<u>Representative example of the challenges caused by the externalisation of the AFSJ</u>	<u>352</u>
A.	Representative example of the evolution of law-making processes	352
B.	Representative example of the complex externalisation of comprehensive approaches addressing criminal threats	354

Bibliography	I
<u>I. Academic sources</u>	<u>I</u>
A. Monographs	I
B. Edited volumes / collective books.....	I
C. Articles and chapters in collective volumes	III
D. Various	V
<u>II. Legislative instruments and policy documents adopted by intergovernmental organisations</u>	<u>VI</u>
A. European Union.....	VI
B. Council of Europe	XII
C. United Nations	XIII
D. ILO.....	XIV
E. OSCE.....	XV
F. Various	XV
<u>IV. Case – law</u>	<u>XVI</u>
A. European Court of Human Rights.....	XVI
B. Court of Justice of the European Union.....	XVI
<u>V. Interventions/conferences.....</u>	<u>XVII</u>

Annex 1 - Measures relating to trafficking in human beings in the EU's cooperation with Western Balkans' countries	XVIII
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------

Annex 2 - European and international standards in the field of the fight against trafficking in human beings	XX
---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----------

<u>I. Criminalisation of the offence of trafficking in human beings and sanctions... XX</u>	<u>XX</u>
<u>II. Institutional framework</u>	<u>XXIII</u>
<u>III. Prevention of trafficking</u>	<u>XXV</u>
<u>IV. Prosecution of traffickers</u>	<u>XXVII</u>
<u>V. Protection of victims of trafficking</u>	<u>XXXIII</u>

Annex III – Council of Europe's Conventions binding upon Belgium and Bosnia and Herzegovina	XXXIX
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--------------